

OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

10 January 2017

RESPONSE TO **REASONS FOR CALL IN**

PART 1

Relating to the Following Decision:

Decision: Approval of Cycle Enfield Proposals for the A1010 North

Decision Date: 14 December 2016

Decision of: Cabinet

Key Decision No: KD4115

1. Introduction

1.1 On 14 December 2016 Cabinet considered a report seeking approval to undertake detailed design and statutory consultation for segregated cycling facilities and public realm improvements on the A1010 North between Southbury Road/ Nags Head Road and Bullsmoor Lane/ Mollison Avenue. These proposals are part of the Mayor's Cycle Vision for London and will be fully funded by Transport for London (TfL). The following specific recommendations were agreed.

- To note the results of the public consultation.
- To note the air quality assessment, the economic impact assessment, the parking assessment, the traffic modelling, the equalities impact assessment and the comments of critical friends.
- That approval be granted to undertake detailed design and statutory consultation for lightly segregated cycling facilities and public realm improvements along the A1010 North, between Southbury Road/ Nags Head Road and Bullsmoor Lane/ Mollison Avenue.
- That approval be granted for capital expenditure of £368,000 for detailed design and statutory consultation, which will be fully funded by Transport for London.
- That delegated authority be granted to the Cabinet Member for Environment to approve and implement the final design of the scheme subject to consultation

and completion of all necessary statutory procedures and make any additional changes as appropriate.

2. Reasons for Call In

2.1 The reasons why the decision was called in are as follows: -

See attached

3. Response to Reasons for Call In

a) Level of support for the proposals

3.1 It should be borne in mind that this was a consultation and not a referendum and its purpose was to enable detailed insights to be captured by those people who had expressed an interest in the plans. These insights were then considered and the designs reviewed. A range of changes were then made in response to a number of concerns that had been raised.

3.2 Given that engagement in the Eastern side of the borough has been more challenging as compared to the West, additional approaches were therefore trialled to supplement the formal consultation process. The primary purpose of the business walk therefore was to act as a further direct reminder to businesses along the route that they had an opportunity to both participate in the consultation and attend the co-design workshop for this scheme.

b) Consultation with bus operators

3.3 The following bus routes use some of all of the A1010 between its junction with the A110 (Southbury Road/Nags Head Road) and the A1055 (Mollison Avenue/Bullsmoor Lane).

Bus Route	Operator
121	Arriva London
191	London General
279	Arriva London
N279	Arriva London
307	Metroline

3.4 Fortnightly meetings to discuss all Cycle Enfield schemes take place between the Council and all relevant TfL stakeholders, including representatives from London

Buses. In particular, the meeting is attended by the Area Manager responsible for bus operations in Enfield and Haringey, whose role includes liaison with the relevant bus operators. Further engagement with both TfL and the bus operators will take place as part of the development of the detailed design.

- 3.5 In line with the requirements of the Local Authorities' Traffic Orders (Procedure) (England and Wales) Regulations 1996, bus operators will be consulted as part of the statutory traffic order making process.

c) Impact on residents' parking

- 3.6 Section 5.8 of the Cabinet Report summarises the parking implications of the proposals for the A1010 North. Paragraph 5.8.1 quantifies the loss of parking and paragraph 5.8.2 summarises the impact of the loss of parking taking into account the results of parking surveys that covered the A1010 itself and 100 metres into each side road. Specifically, paragraph 5.8.1 does not show that "47% of residents bays will disappear". Whilst there is a 37% reduction in the number of marked residents bays, the remaining provision is still sufficient to cater for current demand.

- 3.7 The table below sets out in more detail the impact of the scheme on parking along the length of the A1010 North:

Parking Type	Existing Spaces	Existing Demand	Proposed Spaces	Required Spaces on Side Roads
Residents Bay	54	31	34	N/A
Pay and Display	55	46	49	N/A
Limited Waiting	76	67	53	14
Loading Bay	4	0	4	N/A
Unrestricted	153	131	42	89

- 3.8 As indicated in paragraph 5.8.2 of the report, there are just two sections of the corridor where the peak demand for parking space exceeds supply, taking into account capacity 100m along each of the side roads:

Section of A1010 North	Shortfall
Between Southbury Road/ Nags Head Road and Broadlands Avenue	3 spaces
Between Holly Road and Mollision Avenue/ Bullsmoor Lane	1 space

- 3.9 Where feasible, off-street parking may help meet demand for car parking along the corridor. Further assessments will be carried out as part of the detailed design and crossovers offered free of charge where relevant criteria relating to safety, rear access etc. are met.

d) Adverse economic impact

3.10 Section 5.9 of the Cabinet report summarises the outcome of the economic impact assessment, with the full assessment appended as Appendix D. The overall conclusion of the assessment, based on conservative assumptions, is that the impact of the operational phase will be either neutral or positive, subject to the implementation of the mitigation measures set out in paragraph 5.9.6.

3.11 There will also be an impact during the construction period, which is expected to last approximately three months in both Enfield Highway and Enfield Wash. The annualised impact of the construction phase is included in the tables below. However, the consultant's report highlights that the impact can be further reduced by the implementation of the mitigation measures set out in paragraphs 5.9.4 and 5.9.5 of the Cabinet report.

Enfield Highway

Impacts		Base Case	Better Case	Worse Case
Construction Phase	£	-£73,000	-£19,600	-£179,900
	%	-0.6%	-0.2%	-1.5%
Total Operational Phase (Transport Shift & Town Centre Environment)	£	-£58,700	+£244,900	-£260,700
	%	-0.5%	+2.1%	-2.2%

Enfield Wash

Impacts		Base Case	Better Case	Worse Case
Construction Phase	£	-£149,500	-£57,500	-£333,600
	%	-0.9%	-0.3%	-2.0%
Total Operational Phase (Transport Shift & Town Centre Environment)	£	-£171,600	+£356,200	-£506,100
	%	-1.0%	2.1%	-3.1%

e) Impact on air quality and health

3.12 There is wealth of public health (PH) guidance from the National Institute for Clinical Excellence (NICE) guidance to support cycling. These include PH41 that 'covers encouraging people to increase the amount they walk or cycle for travel or recreation purposes. This further notes that encouraging walking and cycling will help meet other goals including reducing air pollution, itself a significant cause of mortality in England. NICE states that up to 70% of air pollution in urban areas where most human exposure occurs.

3.13 PH8 Physical activity and the environment (2008). This states that 'those responsible for all strategies, policies and plans involving changes to the physical environment, including local transport authorities, transport planners and local authorities' should 'ensure pedestrians, cyclists and users of other modes of transport that involve

physical activity are given the highest priority when developing or maintaining streets and roads’.

- 3.14 PH13 Physical activity in the workplace (2008). This states that ‘Employers in organisations of all sizes’ should ‘Introduce and monitor an organisation-wide, multi-component programme to encourage and support employees to be physically active’. These could include ‘policies to encourage employees to walk, cycle or use other modes of transport involving physical activity (to travel to and from work and as part of their working day).
- 3.15 PH16 Mental Wellbeing in over 65’s (2008): Occupational therapy and physical activity interventions. This states that useful activities of daily life that would help exercise safely for 30 minutes a day include cycling.
- 3.16 PH17 Physical activity for children and young people (2009). This states that opportunities for moderate to vigorous physical activity include everything from competitive sport and formal exercise to active play and other physically demanding activities (such as dancing, swimming or skateboarding). They also include some of the actions that can be involved in daily life (such as walking, cycling or using other modes of travel involving physical activity).
- 3.17 The ‘guidance’ referred to in the call-in is draft guidance for consultation and has caused considerable consternation amongst professionals seeking to encourage active transport. A response is being coordinated through the Faculty of Public Health.
- 3.18 A transport modal shift from motorised to active transport will improve air quality. These actions are part of the Mayor’s Air Quality Strategy (Clearing the air. The Mayor’s Air Quality Strategy) and the City of London’s air quality strategy (City of London Air Quality Strategy 2015 – 2020). Cycling is cited as one of the solutions to air pollution by the GLA (A new Mayor, a new approach to improving air quality, 21st June 2016).

Health

- 3.19 Cycling benefits individual health through physical activity. Some 95% of the population does not meet physical activity guidelines (Health Survey for England, 2008). Cycle programmes have been shown to increase cycling for transport purposes by 50% without any decrease in physical activity in other life-domains (Lancet, Volume 388, Special Issue, S106, November 2016) and that those who undertake cycling for transport purposes are 4 times more likely to meet physical activity guidelines than those who do not (Journal of Public Health, doi: 10.1093/pubmed/fdv182). This includes even taking into account current pollution levels (Preventative Medicine, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.yjpm.2016.02.002>). The Chief Medical Officer (CMO) has stated that that ‘for most people, the easiest and most acceptable forms of physical activity are those that can be incorporated into everyday life’ for which walking and cycling are highlighted as being ‘the easiest and most acceptable forms’ (Start Active, Stay Active (2011). The CMO goes further stating that If a medication existed which had a similar effect to physical activity, it would be regarded as a ‘wonder drug’ or a ‘miracle cure’ (Department of Health,

http://www.ukactive.com/downloads/managed/Dr_David_Walker_Deputy_Chief_Medical_Officer_ukactive_Summit.pdf.

Use of cycle lanes

3.20 Evidence from central London is that if a cycle network is safe and direct people will use that network. For instance, there has been a 50% increase in the number of cyclists using the East-West and North-South cycle superhighways compared to pre-construction levels taking the total number of cyclists to 8,400 using Blackfriars Bridge and 7,000 using Victoria Embankment each day in the morning and evening peaks. 90% of cyclists use the dedicated cycle route rather than the highway (Transport for London, 'Update on the implementation Quietways and the Cycle Superhighways programmes', 30th Nov 2016).

f) Insufficient attention to impact on bus passengers, car passengers and all other vehicles

3.21 Section 5.11 of the Cabinet Report summarises the outcome of the traffic modelling, with the full assessment appended as Appendix G. The modelling has been subject to TfL's Model Audit Process and agreed to represent a realistic assessment of the anticipated impact of the scheme.

3.22 The table below summarises the anticipated peak hour impact on the bus routes as a result of the scheme, based on the latest modelling and has been presented at the TfL stakeholder meeting. Further work is being undertaken in conjunction with TfL stakeholders to look at further mitigation to improve the results shown below.

Bus Route		Proposed Change in Bus Journey Time	
		AM	PM
121	Northbound	0.5-1.5mins	1-2mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	0-1mins
191	Northbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
217	Northbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	0-1mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
279	Northbound	0-1mins	1-2mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
307	Northbound	0.5-1.5mins	0.5-1.5mins
	Southbound	1-2mins	0.5-1.5mins
317	Northbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	0-1mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
327	Northbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
491	Northbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-0.5 to 0.5 mins
	Southbound	-0.5 to 0.5 mins	-1.5 to -0.5 mins